

# Holey Factorizations

J. H. Dinitz  
Department of Mathematics  
University of Vermont  
Burlington VT 05405

D. K. Garnick  
Department of Computer Science  
Bowdoin College  
Brunswick ME 04011

**Abstract:** Holey factorizations of  $K_{v_1, v_2, \dots, v_n}$  are a basic building block in the construction of Room frames. In this paper we give some necessary conditions for the existence of holey factorizations and give a complete enumeration for nonisomorphic sets of orthogonal holey factorizations of several special types.

## 1 Introduction

The use of holes in designs is one of the most powerful tools in combinatorial design theory. The purpose of this paper is to study designs called holey factorizations. These objects are essentially one-factorizations of  $K_n$  with holes. They have been used implicitly in the construction of Room frames, but have never been studied systematically. We will give some general necessary conditions for the existence of holey factorizations, will discuss existence of holey factorizations of certain types and will give a complete enumeration of all nonisomorphic sets of orthogonal holey factorizations of several small types. We begin with the definitions.

Let  $V$  be a set of  $v$  vertices, and let  $\{V_1, \dots, V_n\}$  be a partition of  $V$ , where  $|V_i| = v_i$ . Let  $K_{v_1, \dots, v_n}$  denote the complete multipartite graph with vertices  $V$  and with parts  $\{V_1, \dots, V_n\}$ . These parts are called the *holes* since  $K_{v_1, \dots, v_n} = K_v \setminus \bigcup_{i=1}^n \{xy \mid x, y \in V_i\}$ . A *holey factor* of  $K_{v_1, \dots, v_n}$ , missing hole  $V_i$ , is a one-factor of the graph  $K_{v_1, \dots, v_n} \setminus V_i$  (i.e. a set of edges such that each vertex of  $K_{v_1, \dots, v_n} \setminus V_i$  is on exactly one of these edges and there is no edge between any two vertices in the same hole). A *holey factorization* of  $K_{v_1, \dots, v_n}$  is a partition of the edges of the graph into holey factors such that for each  $1 \leq i \leq n$  there are exactly  $v_i$  holey factors missing hole  $V_i$ .

The *type* of a holey factorization with holes  $\{V_1, V_2, \dots, V_n\}$  is the multiset  $\{|V_1|, |V_2|, \dots, |V_n|\}$ . We will say that a holey factorization has *type*  $T = t_1^{u_1} t_2^{u_2} \dots t_k^{u_k}$  if there are  $u_i$   $V_j$ 's of cardinality  $t_i$ ,  $1 \leq i \leq k$ . If a holey factorization has type  $t^n$  for some  $t$  and  $n$ , then it is called *uniform*.

Holey factorizations represent a special case of a general object called a frame (not to be confused with a Room frame). A *frame* is a group-divisible design  $(X, G, B)$  whose block set admits a partition into *holey* parallel classes, each holey parallel class being a partition of  $X \setminus G_i$  for some group  $G_i \in G$ . A holey factorization is a frame where *every* block has size 2. For further information pertaining to frames in general see [12].

A holey factorization of type  $1^1 3^4$  is given in Figure 1. Note that the holes  $V_1 = \{1\}$ ,  $V_2 = \{2, 3, 4\}$ ,  $V_3 = \{5, 6, 7\}$ ,  $V_4 = \{8, 9, a\}$ , and  $V_5 = \{b, c, d\}$  are written on the left of each holey factorization in square brackets.

[1]	{9 c}	{5 b}	{2 d}	{3 6}	{7 a}	{4 8}
[234]	{8 b}	{a d}	{5 c}	{7 9}	{1 6}	
[234]	{1 c}	{9 b}	{5 d}	{6 a}	{7 8}	
[234]	{5 9}	{a c}	{1 b}	{7 d}	{6 8}	
[567]	{2 a}	{1 8}	{9 d}	{4 b}	{3 c}	
[567]	{a b}	{8 d}	{4 c}	{1 3}	{2 9}	
[567]	{8 c}	{1 d}	{2 b}	{4 9}	{3 a}	
[89a]	{6 d}	{7 c}	{3 b}	{1 2}	{4 5}	
[89a]	{6 b}	{1 7}	{2 c}	{4 d}	{3 5}	
[89a]	{3 d}	{7 b}	{6 c}	{1 4}	{2 5}	
[bcd]	{5 8}	{1 a}	{3 9}	{2 7}	{4 6}	
[bcd]	{6 9}	{4 a}	{2 8}	{3 7}	{1 5}	
[bcd]	{4 7}	{5 a}	{3 8}	{1 9}	{2 6}	

Figure 1: A holey factorization of type  $1^13^4$

Two holey factorizations  $F$  and  $G$ , both of type  $T$ , are said to be *orthogonal* if

1. for any two edges of the underlying graph (say  $e_1$  and  $e_2$ ), if  $e_1$  and  $e_2$  are in the same holey factor in  $F$ , then they are different holey factors of  $G$ ; and
2. any holey factor in  $F$  and any holey factor in  $G$  which are missing the same hole have no edges in common.

Our interest in holey factorizations stems from their connection to Room frames. The following theorem gives this connection. (For results on Room frames see [4] or [5]).

**Theorem 1.1** *The existence of a pair of orthogonal holey factorizations of type  $T$  is equivalent to the existence of a Room frame of type  $T$ .*

The proof is simple. Given a Room frame of type  $T$ , the rows and the columns are both holey factorizations of type  $T$ . Clearly the row holey factorization and the column holey factorization are orthogonal. This construction can be reversed also.

In Figure 2 we give a Room frame of type  $1^13^4$  to help clarify the above connection. Note that the rows of this frame contain the holey factors in the holey factorization given in Figure 1.

Another connection which we wish to point out is given in the following theorem. Note that in order for a holey factorization of type  $1^n$  to exist, then necessarily  $n$  must be odd; each factor consists of  $(n - 1)/2$  edges.

**Theorem 1.2** *The existence of a holey factorization of type  $1^n$  is equivalent to the existence of a one-factorization of  $K_{n+1}$ .*

*Proof.* Given the holey factorization  $F$ , say each holey factor  $f_i$  is missing the vertex  $x_i$ . Add the new vertex  $\infty$  to the graph and let  $h_i = f_i \cup \{x_i, \infty\}$ . Then  $\{h_1, h_2, \dots, h_n\}$  is a one-factorization of the graph  $K_{n+1}$ . This construction is easily reversed. ■

	9c		5b	2d				36		7a	48	
				8b	ad			5c			79	16
				1c	9b		5d				6a	78
59						ac	1b		7d	68		
2a	18	9d						4b	3c			
		ab	8d					4c			13	29
8c								1d	2b	49		3a
	6d		7c			3b				12		45
6b		17			2c	4d				35		
3d	7b	6c			14						25	
		58	1a	39				27	46			
			69	4a		28	37		15			
47	5a				38	19	26					

Figure 2: A Room frame of type  $1^13^4$

Results on one-factorizations of  $K_n$  can be found in [10] or [20].

This paper is organized as follows: Section 2 describes some necessary conditions for the existence of a holey factorization of type  $T$ , in Section 3 we prove the existence of many types of holey factorizations, and in Section 4 we discuss some results on the enumeration of nonisomorphic holey factorizations with small types, and of sets of orthogonal holey factorizations of types  $2^4$  and  $2^5$ .

## 2 Necessary conditions for existence

A holey factorization must have at least three holes; if a holey factorization had two holes, then a factor missing hole  $V_i$  would need to contain edges connecting pairs of vertices in the other hole. The following theorem applies to holey factorizations with exactly three holes.

**Theorem 2.1** *If a holey factorization has exactly three holes then necessarily all the holes must be of the same size.*

The proof follows immediately from the observation that the edges in any of the factors missing hole  $V_i$  must form a matching between the vertices in the remaining two holes. The following is a necessary parity condition.

**Theorem 2.2** *If there exists a holey factorization of type  $t_1^{u_1}t_2^{u_2}\dots t_n^{u_n}$ , then  $t_i \equiv v \pmod{2}$  for each  $i$  where  $v = \sum_{i=1}^n (t_i \times u_i)$  is the number of vertices in the underlying graph.*

*Proof.* Since for each  $i$  there must be a holey factor on  $v - t_i$  vertices, then  $v - t_i$  must be even. Thus  $t_i \equiv v \pmod{2}$ . ■

The next theorem gives a condition on the sizes of the holes.

**Theorem 2.3** *If there exists a holey factorization on  $v$  vertices of type  $T = t_1 t_2 t_3 \dots t_n$ , then  $v \geq 2t_i + t_j$ , for any  $i$  and  $j$ ,*

*Proof.* Let  $V_i$  be a hole of size  $t_i$  and let  $V_j$  be a hole of size  $t_j$ . A holey factor missing  $V_j$  must pair up the vertices in  $V_i$  with a subset of vertices from  $G - V_i - V_j$ . Thus  $t_i \leq v - t_i - t_j$ . ■

Theorems 2.2 and 2.3 are probably close to being sufficient conditions for the existence of holey factorizations. However we exhibit below an infinite class of holey factorizations that is allowed by the previous three theorems yet can not exist. We thank R. M. Wilson for helpful discussions concerning the next theorem.

**Theorem 2.4** *There exists a holey factorization of type  $a^2 t_1 t_2 t_3 \dots t_k$  where  $a = t_1 + t_2 + t_3 + \dots + t_k$  if and only if there exists a holey factorization of type  $t_1 t_2 t_3 \dots t_k$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $U_1$  and  $U_2$  be the two holes of size  $a$  and let  $V_1, V_2, V_3, \dots, V_k$  be the holes of sizes  $t_1, t_2, t_3, \dots, t_k$ , respectively. Now note that the  $2a$  holey factors missing either  $U_1$  or  $U_2$  must contain every edge from  $V_1, V_2, V_3, \dots, V_k$  to  $U_1$  and  $U_2$ . Thus, ignoring the edges between  $U_1$  and  $U_2$ , the holey factors missing the holes  $V_1, V_2, V_3, \dots, V_k$  constitute a holey factorization of type  $t_1 t_2 t_3 \dots t_k$ . Thus, if there exists a holey factorization of type  $a^2 t_1 t_2 t_3 \dots t_k$ , then there exists a holey factorization of type  $t_1 t_2 t_3 \dots t_k$ .

Conversely, begin with a holey factorization of type  $a^3$  which exists by Theorem 3.1 below. Use Theorem 3.6 to fill in one hole of size  $a$  with a holey factorization of type  $t_1 t_2 t_3 \dots t_k$ . The resulting frame has type  $a^2 t_1 t_2 t_3 \dots t_k$ . ■

**Corollary 2.5** *There does not exist a holey factorization of type  $a^2 b^1 c^1$  if  $b + c \leq a$ .*

*Proof.* If  $b + c < a$ , then this holey factorization does not exist by Theorem 2.3. If  $b + c = a$ , the frame does not exist by Theorem 2.4 since there is no holey factorization of type  $b^1 c^1$ . ■

Theorem 2.4 provides an infinite class of nonexistent holey factorizations which satisfy the necessary conditions of Theorems 2.2 and 2.3. Essentially, given a type  $T$  ( $|T| = t$ ) for which no holey factorization exists, Theorem 2.4 states that there also does not exist a holey factorization of type  $t^2 T$ . This process can then be repeated to show that there does not exist a holey factorization of type  $(3t)^2 t^2 T$ , etc. For example, since there is no holey factorization of type  $2^2$ , there is no holey factorization of type  $4^2 2^2$ . This in turn implies that there is no holey factorization of type  $12^2 4^2 2^2$ . There is also never a holey factorization of type  $t^2 abc$  where  $a + b + c = t$  and  $a \neq b$ , since holey factorizations of type  $abc$  exist only if  $a = b = c$  (Theorem 2.1).

The next theorem extends Theorem 2.3 to the case of  $d$  orthogonal holey factorizations. The case of  $d = 2$  was originally proven in [17].

**Theorem 2.6** *If there exists a set of  $d$  orthogonal holey factorization on  $v$  vertices of type  $T = t_1 t_2 t_3 \dots t_n$ , then  $v \geq (d + 1)t_i + t_j$ , for any  $i$  and  $j$ .*

*Proof.* Let  $V_i$  be a hole of size  $t_i$  and let  $V_j$  be a hole of size  $t_j$  (containing the vertex  $x$ ). Also let  $\{F_1, F_2, \dots, F_d\}$  be a set of  $d$  pairwise orthogonal holey factorizations. Since the holey factors missing  $V_i$  must contain an edge on the vertex  $x$ , and since all of the holey factors in  $F_1, F_2, \dots$  and  $F_d$  which are missing hole  $V_i$  contain no edges in common, we deduce that there must be at least  $d \times t_i$  vertices other than the vertices in  $V_i$  or  $V_j$ . So  $d \times t_i \leq v - t_i - t_j$  and hence  $v \geq (d + 1)t_i + t_j$ . ■

### 3 Existence of holey factorizations

In this section we will briefly discuss the existence of holey factorizations of certain specified types. Two particular types of Room frames have been extensively studied by researchers; these are frames of type  $h^u$  and of type  $1^{u-v}v^1$ . There have been numerous papers concerning the existence of these frames over the past 15 years. Recently, both spectra (for Room frames) have been essentially determined [19]. In contrast to the apparent difficulty in finding the spectra of the frames of these types, the first two theorems of this section give complete answers to the spectra of holey factorizations of these types. The remainder of this section will discuss some holey factorizations of other types.

The first result concerns uniform holey factorizations (type  $h^u$ ). The proof can be found in [12] (Theorem 1.4). Note that the conditions are necessary by Theorem 2.2.

**Theorem 3.1** (Rees-Stinson) *There exists a holey factorization of type  $h^u$  if and only if  $u \geq 3$  and  $h(u - 1) \equiv 0 \pmod{2}$ .*

Holey factorizations of type  $1^{u-v}v^1$  correspond to one-factorizations of  $K_{u+1}$  which contain sub one-factorizations of  $K_{v+1}$ . This problem has also been solved completely.

**Theorem 3.2** (Cruse [1]) *There exists a holey factorization of type  $1^{u-v}v^1$  if and only if  $u$  and  $v$  are odd and  $u \geq 2v + 1$ .*

Since the existence of a Room frame of type  $T$  implies the existence of a holey factorization of type  $T$  (via Theorem 1.1), results on the existence of Room frames apply to holey factorizations also. We summarize the list of known frames in the following theorem.

**Theorem 3.3** *There exist frames (and hence holey factorizations) of the following types*

1.  $1^a 3^b$  for all  $a + b = 5, 7$  or  $9$ , except for  $(a, b) = (2, 3), (3, 2), (4, 1), (5, 0), (5, 2)$  or  $(6, 1)$ , [5]
2.  $2^a 4^b$  for all  $a + b \in \{6, 7, \dots, 14, 31, 42, 43, 44\}$  or if  $a + b \geq 48$ , [5]
3.  $2^n u^1$  if and only if  $u$  is even and  $n \geq u + 1$ , except possibly for  $2^{19} 18^1$ . [6] [19]

The following three constructions are recursive constructions for holey factorizations.

If  $T$  is the type  $t_1^{u_1} t_2^{u_2} \dots t_n^{u_n}$  and  $m$  is an integer, then  $mT$  is defined to be the type  $(mt_1)^{u_1} (mt_2)^{u_2} \dots (mt_n)^{u_n}$ . The following recursive construction is referred to as the Inflation Construction. It essentially “blows up” every hole by use of a Latin square of order  $m$  (thought of as a one-factorization of  $K_{n,n}$ ). We leave the details to the reader.

**Construction 3.4** *Suppose there exists a holey factorization of type  $T$  and suppose that  $m$  is a positive integer, then there exists a holey factorization of type  $mT$ .*

An interesting fact to note in the above construction is that  $m$  can be *any* positive integer. In the analogous theorem for frames there is a restriction that  $m \neq 2$  or  $6$ .

The Fundamental Holey Factorization Construction follows immediately from the Fundamental Frame Construction [17].

**Construction 3.5 (Fundamental Holey Factorization Construction)** *Let  $(X, \mathcal{G}, \mathcal{A})$  be a group divisible design having type  $T$ , and let  $w : X \rightarrow \mathbf{Z}^+ \cup \{0\}$  (we say that  $w$  is a weighting). For every  $A \in \mathcal{A}$ , suppose there is a holey factorization having type  $\{w(x) : x \in A\}$ . Then there is a holey factorization of type  $\{\sum_{x \in G} w(x) : G \in \mathcal{G}\}$ .*

The final recursive construction that we present here is a Filling in the Hole Construction. The proof is immediate.

**Construction 3.6** *Suppose that there exists a holey factorization of type  $T = t_1^{u_1} t_2^{u_2} \dots t_n^{u_n}$  and a holey factorization of type  $S = s_1^{v_1} s_2^{v_2} \dots s_m^{v_m}$  where  $t_1 = \sum_{i=1}^m (s_i \times v_i)$ , then there exists a holey factorization of type  $t_1^{u_1-1} (s_1^{v_1} s_2^{v_2} \dots s_m^{v_m}) t_2^{u_2} \dots t_n^{u_n}$ .*

There are many more recursive constructions that can be used to construct holey factorizations. Essentially, any recursive construction for Room frames will work for holey factorizations. This includes the Filling in the Holes and Fundamental Construction above, as well as the use of holey transversals, and the use of frame starters and intransitive frame starters. It is beyond our scope to discuss these additional constructions here. The interested reader is referred to [5], [17], [18], and [19].

The next two theorems follow from Theorem 3.3, where the missing cases were constructed using a modification of the hill-climbing algorithm for one-factorizations (described in [4]) to holey factorizations. This algorithm is extremely fast and effective in constructing holey factorizations. Files containing these factorizations are available from the authors.

**Theorem 3.7** *There exists a holey factorization of type  $1^a 3^b$  for all  $a + b \in \{5, 7, 9\}$ .*

**Theorem 3.8** *There exists a holey factorization of type  $2^a 4^b$  if and only if  $a + b \geq 4$  with  $(a, b) \neq (2, 2)$  or if  $(a, b) = (3, 0)$  or  $(0, 3)$ .*

Note that the conditions in Theorem 3.8 are necessary by Theorems 2.1 and 2.2. The holey factorizations of types  $2^3$  and  $4^3$  exist by Theorem 3.1. The remaining holey factorizations which were missing from Theorem 3.3(2) were again constructed by the authors using the hill-climbing algorithm for holey factorizations.

We have also generated holey factorizations for other small orders by use of the hill-climbing algorithm for holey factorizations. We record these in the next theorem.

**Theorem 3.9** *There exist holey factorizations of the following types:  $2^4 6^1$ ,  $2^3 6^2$ ,  $2^2 6^3$ ,  $2^1 6^4$ , and  $2^3 4^1 6^1$ .*

In the next theorem we will be concerned with holey factorizations of type  $2^n u^1$ . From Theorems 2.2 and 2.3 we have that necessarily  $u$  must be even and  $n \geq \frac{1}{2}u + 1$ . From Theorem 3.3(3) there is a holey factorization of type  $2^n u^1$  if  $n \geq u + 1$ . In the theorem below we will show essentially that if  $n \geq \frac{2}{3}u$ , then there exists a holey factorization of type  $2^n u^1$ .

**Theorem 3.10** *There exists a holey factorization of type  $2^n u^1$  if*

1.  $n \geq \frac{1}{2}u + 1$ ,  $u \equiv 2 \pmod{4}$  and  $n$  is even,
2.  $n \geq \frac{2}{3}u$  and  $u \equiv 0 \pmod{6}$ ,
3.  $n \geq \frac{2}{3}(u + 2)$  and  $u \equiv 4 \pmod{6}$ , and
4.  $n \geq \frac{2}{3}(u + 4)$  and  $u \equiv 2 \pmod{6}$ .

*Proof.* Statement 1 follows from Theorem 3.2 and Theorem 3.4 with  $m = 2$ .

To prove statement 2, give weight 2 to every point in the first three groups of a transversal design  $TD(5, t)$ , give weights 2, 4 or 6 to every point in the fourth group and give weight 6 to every point in the last group. (Note that  $t \neq 2, 3, 6, 10$ ). Apply Construction 3.5, using the fact that holey factorizations of type  $2^4 6^1$ ,  $2^3 4^1 6^1$  and  $2^3 6^2$  all exist by Theorem 3.9. Now fill in the first three groups with holey factorizations of type  $2^t$ . Also fill in the fourth group with a holey factorization of type  $2^a$  for  $t \leq a \leq 3t$ . Thus for every  $4t \leq s \leq 6t$  we have constructed a holey factorization of type  $2^s (6t)^1$ . Let  $u = 6t$  to get that there is a holey factorization of type  $2^s u^1$  for all  $\frac{2}{3}u \leq s \leq u$ , except for the cases  $2^i 12^1$  for  $8 \leq i \leq 12$ ,  $2^i 18^1$  for  $12 \leq i \leq 18$ ,  $2^i 36^1$  for  $24 \leq i \leq 36$ , and  $2^i 60^1$  for  $40 \leq i \leq 60$ .

To handle the case  $u = 36$ , first begin with transversal designs  $TD(5, 12)$ . Give weight 1 to every point in the first three groups, give weight either 1 or 3 to the points in the fourth group and give weight 3 to every point in the last group. Apply Construction 3.5, using the fact that holey factorizations of type  $1^a 3^{5-a}$  exist for  $a = 3, 4$  by Theorem 3.7. The construction now proceeds as above by filling in the first four groups with holey factorizations of type  $2^a$  for  $6 \leq a \leq 18$ . The case  $u = 60$  is done similarly beginning with a  $TD(5, 20)$ . All of the missing cases for  $u = 12$  and  $u = 18$  (including  $2^{19} 18^1$ ) were constructed on the computer by use of the hill-climbing algorithm. The final result now follows from Theorem 3.3(3).

Statement 3 is proven in a similar manner. Now give all the points in the last group of the  $TD(5, t)$  weight 6 except for one point which receives weight 4. The proof

is then the same as above. Again the exceptional cases occur when  $t = 2, 3, 6, 10$ . The cases for  $t = 2$  and  $t = 3$  ( $u = 10$  and  $u = 16$ , respectively) were handled by the computer. For  $t = 6$  and  $t = 10$  ( $u = 34$  and  $u = 58$ , respectively) use the same construction as above for  $u = 36$  and  $u = 60$  except in the last group give weight 1 to exactly one point.

Statement 4 follows this same pattern. Here we give all the points in that last group weight 6 except for one point which receives weight 2. The proof is again the same as above where once more the exceptional cases occur when  $t = 2, 3, 6, 10$ . The cases for  $t = 2$  and  $t = 3$  ( $u = 8$  and  $u = 14$ , respectively) were handled by the computer. For  $t = 6$  and  $t = 10$  ( $u = 32$  and  $u = 56$ , respectively) use the same construction as above for  $u = 36$  and  $u = 60$  except in the last group give weight 1 to exactly two points. ■

## 4 Enumerating nonisomorphic holey factorizations

In this section we will enumerate the nonisomorphic holey factorizations of types  $2^3$ ,  $3^3$ ,  $2^4$  and  $2^5$ . In addition we will enumerate nonisomorphic sets of orthogonal holey factorizations of type  $2^5$ . We begin by defining isomorphic holey factorizations.

Two holey factorizations  $F$  and  $H$  of a graph  $G$ , say  $F = \{f_1, f_2, \dots, f_k\}$ ,  $H = \{h_1, h_2, \dots, h_k\}$ , are called *isomorphic* if there exists a map  $\phi$  from the vertex-set of  $G$  onto itself such that  $\{f_1\phi, f_2\phi, \dots, f_k\phi\} = \{h_1, h_2, \dots, h_k\}$ . Here  $f_i\phi$  is the set of all the edges  $\{x\phi, y\phi\}$  where  $\{x, y\}$  is an edge in  $f_i$ .

The exact number of nonisomorphic one-factorizations (OFs) of  $K_n$  is known only for even  $n \leq 12$ . It is easy to see that there is a unique one-factorization of  $K_2$ ,  $K_4$ , and  $K_6$ . There are exactly six for  $K_8$ ; these were found by Dickson and Safford [2] and a full exposition is given in [21]. In 1973, Gelling [7] proved that there are exactly 396 isomorphism classes of OFs of  $K_{10}$ . Recently, Dinitz, Garnick, and McKay [3] determined that there are 526,915,620 nonisomorphic OFs of  $K_{12}$ .

It is easy to check that there is a unique holey factorization of each of the types  $1^1$ ,  $1^3$  and  $1^5$ . The automorphism group of each of the six one-factorizations of  $K_8$  is transitive on points (see [21]). Thus by deleting a point to form a holey factorization of type  $1^7$ , we see that there are also exactly six nonisomorphic holey factorizations of this type.

In the next theorem we will count the number of distinct holey factorizations of type  $t^3$ . The underlying graph here is  $K_{t,t,t}$ . Let  $V_1, V_2$ , and  $V_3$  be the three holes. The number of distinct ways to pick the holey factors missing hole  $V_i$  is obviously the number of distinct one-factorizations of  $K_{t,t}$ . This in turn is the number of distinct latin squares of side  $t$  with the first column fixed. We get the following theorem.

**Theorem 4.1** *The number of distinct holey factorizations of type  $t^3$ , with fixed holes, is  $[L(t)]^3$ , where  $L(t)$  is the number of distinct Latin squares of order  $t$  with the first column fixed.*

Since  $L(2) = 1$  and  $L(3) = 2$ , then it follows that there is a unique holey factorization of  $2^3$  and 8 distinct holey factorizations of type  $3^3$ .

**Theorem 4.2** *There are 2 nonisomorphic holey factorizations of type  $3^3$ .*

*Proof.* Without loss of generality, one can fix the first six factors, as well as one edge in the seventh factor, in a holey factorization of type  $3^3$ . There are two choices for the second edge in the seventh factor, and that choice determines the rest of the factorization. Thus, there are at most two isomorphism classes of holey factorizations of type  $3^3$ ; representatives,  $A$  and  $B$ , of the classes are shown in Figure 3, where the holes are indicated as triples in square brackets. If we choose any three holey

A:	[123] 47 58 69	B:	[123] 47 58 69
	[123] 48 59 67		[123] 48 59 67
	[123] 49 57 68		[123] 49 57 68
	[456] 17 28 39		[456] 17 28 39
	[456] 18 29 37		[456] 18 29 37
	[456] 19 27 38		[456] 19 27 38
	[789] 14 25 36		[789] 14 26 35
	[789] 15 26 34		[789] 15 24 36
	[789] 16 24 35		[789] 16 25 34

Figure 3: The two nonisomorphic holey factorizations of type  $3^3$

factors  $f$ ,  $g$ , and  $h$  from  $A$  such that each of the three is missing a different hole, then  $f \cup g \cup h$  forms either three disjoint triangles, or a single 9-cycle. However, if we choose any three holey factors  $f$ ,  $g$ , and  $h$  from  $B$ , again such that each is missing a different hole, then  $f \cup g \cup h$  forms a triangle and a disjoint 6-cycle. Thus,  $A$  and  $B$  are nonisomorphic, and there are two equivalence classes of  $3^3$  holey factorizations. ■

In order to count holey factorizations on a larger number of holes we use the computer. We construct nonisomorphic holey factorizations by use of an *orderly algorithm*; it generates the nonisomorphic holey factorizations of type  $T$  in a lexicographic order defined in the following way. First, if  $F = \{f_1, f_2, \dots, f_n\}$  is a holey factorization, then we must have  $f_i < f_j$  for all  $i < j$ . Then we say that  $F > H = \{h_1, h_2, \dots, h_n\}$  if there is some  $k$ ,  $1 \leq k \leq n$ , such that  $f_i = h_i$  for all  $i < k$  and  $f_k > h_k$ . We define a similar ordering on partial holey factorizations consisting of fewer than  $n$  factors.

The algorithm builds up each factorization by adding one factor at a time and rejects a partial factorization if it is not the lowest representative (lexicographically) of all the partial factorizations in its isomorphism class. In this way, the algorithm generates only the lowest representative of any isomorphism class of factorizations and as such never generates any holey factorizations which are isomorphic to each other. This approach saves both time and space over algorithms which first generate distinct (but possibly isomorphic) factorizations and then use methods to winnow isomorphs.

This type of algorithm has been used in other combinatorial searches including enumerating Latin squares [11], strong starters [8], one-factorizations of small graphs [13, 15], perfect one-factorizations of  $K_{14}$  [14], and Howell designs of small order

[13]. Our algorithm below is essentially the one that was described in [3] to count the nonisomorphic one-factorizations of  $K_{12}$ . However, our algorithm here reduces the search space by assuming a first fixed factor consisting of the hyper-edges that correspond to the holes.

**Theorem 4.3** *There are 2 nonisomorphic holey factorizations of type  $2^4$  and, for a fixed set of holes, there are 40 distinct holey factorizations of type  $2^4$ .*

Using the orderly algorithm we generated the lexicographically lowest representatives of the two isomorphism classes of holey factorizations of type  $2^4$ . The computation required about .1 seconds at a rate of 20 mips. The two factorizations are shown in Figure 4.

1:    [1 2] 35 47 68 $ Aut  = 12$ [1 2] 36 48 57 [3 4] 15 28 67 [3 4] 17 26 58 [5 6] 14 27 38 [5 6] 18 24 37 [7 8] 13 25 46 [7 8] 16 23 45	2:    [1 2] 35 47 68 $ Aut  = 48$ [1 2] 38 46 57 [3 4] 15 28 67 [3 4] 17 26 58 [5 6] 13 27 48 [5 6] 18 24 37 [7 8] 14 25 36 [7 8] 16 23 45
---	---

Figure 4: The two nonisomorphic holey factorizations of type  $2^4$

We determined the orders of the automorphism groups by counting the number of permutations that mapped a factorization onto itself while checking that the factorization was the lexicographically lowest representative of its isomorphism class. We checked the results by using *nauty* [9] to determine the order of the automorphism group of the line graph corresponding to the factorization. If we label the nonisomorphic holey factorizations of type  $2^4$  as  $F_i$ ,  $1 \leq i \leq 2$ , then the number of distinct holey factorizations of type  $2^4$ , with fixed holes, can be computed as

$$\sum_{i=1}^2 \frac{4! 2^4}{|Aut(F_i)|} = 40$$

We checked this result by fixing the holes, and using backtracking to generate all distinct factorizations.

**Theorem 4.4** *There are 747 nonisomorphic holey factorizations of type  $2^5$  and, for a fixed set of holes, there are 2,253,312 distinct holey factorizations of type  $2^5$ .*

Again, we used the orderly algorithm to generate the lexicographically lowest representatives of the isomorphism classes of holey factorizations of type  $2^5$ . The computation required about 20 minutes at a rate of 20 mips. The file containing these 747 holey factorizations is available from the authors.

We computed the orders of the automorphism groups in the same ways as for the  $2^4$  factorizations. We computed the number of distinct holey factorizations of type  $2^5$ , with fixed holes, as

$$\sum_{i=1}^{747} \frac{5! 2^5}{|Aut(F_i)|} = 2,253,312$$

where  $\{F_i | 1 \leq i \leq 747\}$  is the set of nonisomorphic holey factorizations of type  $2^5$ . Checking this result with backtracking required 5.5 hours of cpu time at 20 mips.

We now turn our attention to nonisomorphic *sets* of orthogonal holey factorizations. There does not exist a pair of orthogonal holey factorizations of type  $2^4$  [16]. We will show below that there are pairs (in fact triples) of orthogonal holey one-factorizations of type  $2^5$ .

Two sets of orthogonal holey factorizations  $\bar{F}$  and  $\bar{H}$  of type  $T$ , say  $\bar{F} = \{F_1, F_2, \dots, F_s\}$ ,  $\bar{H} = \{H_1, H_2, \dots, H_s\}$ , are called *isomorphic* if there exists a map  $\phi$  from the vertex-set of  $G$  onto itself such that  $\{F_1\phi, F_2\phi, \dots, F_s\phi\} = \{H_1, H_2, \dots, H_s\}$ . When  $s = 2$ , this corresponds to the notion of isomorphic Room frames of type  $T$ .

We extend the ordering used for holey factorizations to an ordering of sets of holey factorizations. First, if  $\bar{F} = \{F_1, F_2, \dots, F_s\}$  is a set of orthogonal holey factorizations, then we must have  $F_i < F_j$  for all  $i < j$ . Then we say that  $\bar{F} > \bar{H}$  if there is some  $t$ ,  $1 \leq t \leq s$ , such that  $F_i = H_i$  for all  $i < t$  and  $F_t > H_t$ . Using this ordering we obtained the following results.

- Theorem 4.5**
1. *There are 64 nonisomorphic sets of two orthogonal holey factorizations of type  $2^5$ .*
  2. *There are 28 nonisomorphic sets of three orthogonal holey factorizations of type  $2^5$ .*
  3. *There are no nonisomorphic sets of four orthogonal holey factorizations of type  $2^5$ .*

We generated the 64 mutually orthogonal pairs of factorizations in the following way. Let  $F_i$ ,  $1 \leq i \leq 747$  be the lexicographically lowest nonisomorphic factorizations as described in Theorem 4.4. We attempted to pair each  $F_i$ ,  $1 \leq i \leq 747$ , with each possible permutation of  $F_j$ ,  $i \leq j \leq 747$ . We checked each successful pairing to see if it was the lexicographically lowest such pair in its isomorphism class.

The Appendix displays the 64 pairs as Room frames of type  $2^5$ . We counted the sets of three and four orthogonal holey factorizations in a similar way. The Appendix also lists the sets of three orthogonal factorizations of type  $2^5$ .

## References

- [1] A.B. Cruse, On embedding incomplete symmetric Latin squares, *J. Combin. Theory (A)* **16** (1974), 18–22.
- [2] L.E. Dickson and F.H. Safford, Solution to problem 8 (group theory). *Amer. Math. Monthly* **13** (1906), 150–151.
- [3] J.H. Dinitz, D.K. Garnick, and B.D. McKay, There are 526,915,620 nonisomorphic one-factorizations of  $K_{12}$ , *J. Comb. Des.*, **2** (1994), 273–285.
- [4] J.H. Dinitz and D.R. Stinson, “Room Squares and Related Designs”, *Contemporary Design Theory*, J.H. Dinitz and D.R. Stinson, eds., Wiley, New York, 1992, pp. 137–204.
- [5] J.H. Dinitz and D.R. Stinson, A few more Room frames, *Graphs Matrices and Designs*, R. Rees (Editor), Dekker, New York, 1993, pp. 133–146.
- [6] G. Ge and L.Zhu, Existence of Room frames of type  $2^nu^1$ , *J. Comb. Math. and Comb. Comput.*, (to appear).
- [7] E.N. Gelling and R.E. Odeh, On 1-factorizations of the complete graph and the relationship to round-robin schedules. *Congressus Num.* **9**(1974), 213–221.
- [8] W.L. Kocay, D.R. Stinson and S.A. Vanstone, On strong starters in cyclic groups, *Discrete Math.* **56** (1985), 45–60.
- [9] B.D. McKay, *nauty* User’s Guide, Computer Science Dept., Australian National University, Canberra, Australia.
- [10] E. Mendelsohn and A. Rosa, One-factorizations of the complete graph – A survey, *J. Graph Theory* **9** (1985), 43–65.
- [11] R.C. Read, Every one a winner, *Annals of Discrete Math.* **2** (1978), 107–120.
- [12] R.S. Rees and D.R. Stinson, Frames with block size four, *Can. J. Math.* **44** (1992), 1030–1049.
- [13] E. Seah and D.R. Stinson, An enumeration of non-isomorphic one-factorizations and Howell designs for the graph  $K_{10}$  minus a one-factor, *Ars Combin.* **21** (1986), 145–161.
- [14] E. Seah and D.R. Stinson, Some perfect one-factorizations for  $K_{14}$ . *Ann. Discrete Math.* **34** (1987), 419–436.
- [15] E. Seah and D.R. Stinson, On the enumeration of one-factorizations of the complete graph containing prescribed automorphism groups. *Math Comp.* **50** (1988), 607–618.
- [16] D.R. Stinson, The non-existence of a (2,4)-frame, *Ars Combin.* **11** (1981), 99–106.

- [17] D.R. Stinson, Some constructions for frames, Room squares, and subsquares, *Ars Combin.* **12** (1981), 229–267.
- [18] D.R. Stinson and L. Zhu, Towards the spectrum of Room squares with subsquares, *J. Comb. Theor Ser. A* **63** (1993), 129–142.
- [19] D.R. Stinson, L. Zhu and J.H. Dinitz, On the spectra of certain classes of Room frames, (preprint).
- [20] W.D. Wallis, One-factorizations of complete graphs, in *Contemporary Design Theory*, pp. 593–631, J.H. Dinitz and D.R. Stinson, eds., John Wiley and Sons, New York, 1992.
- [21] W.D. Wallis, A.P. Street and J.S. Wallis, *Combinatorics: Room squares, sun-free sets, Hadamard matrices* Lect. Notes Math. **292**, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1972.

# Appendix: Nonisomorphic sets of orthogonal holey factorizations of type $2^5$

The 64 sets of two orthogonal holey factorizations of type  $2^5$  are displayed below as Room frames. Beneath the index of each Room frame is the pair of indices of the constituent holey factorizations. For example, Room frame 1 is derived from holey factorizations 1 and 690. The first holey factorization of each pair, which yields the rows of the Room frame, is always in canonical (lexicographically lowest) form; the second holey factorization, yielding the columns, is not necessarily in canonical form.

1:  
1  
690

			79	68		35	24		
		69	78			34			25
59	48							17	06
			16	07	58	49			
26						19	08		37
	27	18	09					36	
	39	04	15	28					
38				29				05	14
		57	46		13	02			
47	56			03			12		

2:  
1  
690

				68	79		35	24	
		69	78			34			25
59	48				17	06			
						58	49	16	07
26						19	08	37	
	27	18	09					36	
	39	04	15		28				
38				29				05	14
		57	46		13	02			
47	56			03			12		

3:  
1  
690

			68	79			35		24	
				78	69		34		25	
59	48								17	06
					16	07	49	58		
26		19	08							37
	27						18	09	36	
	39	04	15		28					
38				29					05	14
		57	46		13	02				
47	56			03			12			

4:  
1  
690

		79	68				35		24	
			78	69	34			25		
59	48								17	06
				16	07	58	49			
26						19	08		37	
	27	18	09					36		
	39				28				04	15
38		05	14	29						
		46	57		13	02				
47	56			03			12			

5:  
1  
690

				79	68	35			24	
		78	69				34	25		
59	48								17	06
					16	07	49	58		
26		19	08							37
	27					18	09	36		
	39			28					04	15
38		05	14	29						
		46	57		13	02				
47	56			03			12			

6:  
1  
690

				68	79	35			24		
			78	69				34	25		
59	48				17	06					
							49	58	16	07	
26		19	08							37	
	27						18	09		36	
	39				28					04	15
38		05	14	29							
		46	57		13	02					
47	56			03			12				

7:  
1  
690

			79	68		24	35			
		69			78			34	25	
59					17	06		48		
	49						58		16	07
26	37		08			19				
		18					09	27	36	
	28	04	15	39						
38				29				05	14	
		57	46	02	13					
47	56				03	12				

8:  
1  
746

				68	79	24	35			
		69	78					34	25	
59	48				17	06				
						58	49	16	07	
26	37					19	08			
		18	09					27	36	
		04	15	39	28					
38	29							05	14	
		57	46	02	13					
47	56				03	12				

9:  
1  
746

				79	68			24	35	
		69	78			34	25			
59	48								17	06
						16	07	58	49	
26	37						19	08		
		18	09						36	27
		04	15	28	39					
38	29								05	14
		57	46			02	13			
47	56			03	12					

10:  
1  
690

		79	68			35	24
		69		78	25	34	
	59			17	06	48	
49						58	16 07
26	37		08			19	
		18				09	27 36
	28			39			04 15
38	05	14		29			
57	46		02	13			
		47	56			03	12

11:  
1  
746

				68	79	24	35
				78	69		34 25
				17	06	59	48
49	58						16 07
26	37	19	08				
						18	09 27 36
		04	15	39	28		
38	29						05 14
57	46		02	13			
		56	47			03	12

12:  
1  
746

				68	79			24	35
						78	69		25 34
								59	48 17 06
49	58					16	07		
26	37	19	08						
								18	09 36 27
						39	28		04 15
38	29	05	14						
57	46			02	13				
		47	56					03	12

13:  
2  
690

				79	68			35	24	
				69	78			34		25
59	48								17	06
						16	07	58	49	
26								19	08	37
	27	18	09							36
	39	04	15	28						
38					29				05	14
47	56					13	02			
		57	46	03						12

14:  
2  
690

				68	79			35		24
						78	69		34	25
59	48									17 06
						16	07	49	58	
26		19	08							37
	27							18	09	36
	39	04	15		28					
38					29					05 14
47	56					13	02			
		57	46	03						12

15:  
2  
690

				68	79			35		24
						69	78		34	25
59	48							17	06	
										49 58 16 07
26		19	08							37
	27							18	09	36
	39	04	15	28						
38					29					05 14
47	56					13	02			
		57	46	03						12

16:  
2  
690

				79	68			35		24
						78	69	34		25
59	48									17 06
						16	07	58	49	
26								19	08	37
	27	18	09							36
	39				28					04 15
38	05	14	29							
47	56					13	02			
		46	57	03						12

17:  
2  
690

				79	68			35		24
						69	78	34		25
59	48					17	06			
								58	49	16 07
26								19	08	37
	27	18	09							36
	39				28					04 15
38	05	14	29							
47	56					13	02			
		46	57	03						12

18:  
2  
690

						68	79	35		24
								78	69	34 25
59	48							17	06	
										49 58 16 07
26		19	08							37
	27							18	09	36
	39				28					04 15
38	05	14	29							
47	56					13	02			
		46	57	03						12

19:  
2  
690

				79	68			24	35	
				69		78				34 25
59						17	06		48	
	49							58		16 07
26	37		08					19		
		18							09	27 36
	28	04	15	39						
38					29					05 14
47	56				02	13				
		57	46					03	12	

20:  
2  
690

				79			68	24	35	
						69	78			25 34
59									48	17 06
	49							16	07	58
26	37		08					19		
		18							09	36 27
	28				39					04 15
38	05	14	29							
47	56				02	13				
		46	57					03	12	

21:  
2  
746

						68	79	24	35	
						69	78			34 25
59	48							17	06	
										58 49 16 07
26	37							19	08	
		18	09							27 36
	04	15	39	28						
38	29									05 14
47	56				02	13				
		57	46					03	12	

22:  
2  
746

				79	68			24	35	
				69	78			34	25	
59	48									17 06
						16	07	58	49	
26	37							19	08	
		18	09							36 27
	04	15	28	39						
38	29									05 14
47	56					02	13			
		57	46	03	12					

23:  
2  
746

				68	79				24	35
						78	69	25	34	
59	48									17 06
						16	07	49	58	
26	37	19	08							
								18	09	36 27
	04	15	39	28						
38	29									05 14
47	56				02	13				
		57	46					03	12	

24:  
2  
746

						68	79		35	24
								78	69	25 34
59	48							17	06	
										49 58 16 07
26	37	19	08							
								18	09	27 36
						39	28			04 15
38	29	05	14							
47	56				02	13				
		46	57					03	12	

25:  
4  
312

			79	68			35	24
		69	78			34	25	
			06		59	48	17	
49	56			07	18			
		08				19	26	37
27	38		09					16
58	29			13				04
		14		28	39			05
36	47		15		02			
		57	46		12		03	

26:  
6  
312

			79	68			35	24
		69	78			34	25	
			06		59	48	17	
49	56			07	18			
		08				19	27	36
37	28		09					16
58	39			12				04
		14		38	29			05
		57	46		13	02		
26	47		15				03	

27:  
7  
670

			79			68		35	24
			69	78			34		25
	48				17	59		06	
57				19		08			46
	39	16					28		07
26			18				09	37	
49		58		02					13
38		04			29				15
	56		47		03	12			
27		05	36				14		

28:  
7  
673

			79			68		35	24
			69	78			34		25
48					17	59		06	
57				19		08			46
	39	16					28		07
26			18				09	37	
	49	58		02					13
	38	04			29				15
	56		47		03	12			
27		05	36					14	

29:  
9  
746

				68	79			35	24
			78	69			25	34	
59	48							17	06
				19	08			46	57
		16	07			39	28		
26	37					18	09		
		49	58					02	13
38	29	05	14						
47	56			03	12				
				27	36	04	15		

30:  
19  
746

				68	79			35	24	
			69	78			25	34		
					17	06	48	59		
57	46					19	08			
	38	29						16	07	
			18	09					27	36
49	58			02	13					
				39	28				04	15
		47	56			03	12			
26	37	05	14							

31:  
20  
670

			79			68		35	24
			78		69	34			25
59					17		48	06	
	46			19		08			57
	38		16			29			07
27	18						09		36
	58	49	02						13
	39		05		28				14
47	56			03		12			
26		04	37					15	

32:  
20  
673

			79			68		35	24
			78		69	34			25
	59				17		48	06	
	46			19		08			57
	38		16			29			07
27	18						09		36
	58		49	02					13
39			05		28				14
47	56			03		12			
26		04	37					15	

33:  
52  
55

				79	68			35	24
			69	78			25	34	
59					06		18		47
48					07		19		56
	27	08				39		16	
	36		09				28		17
	49		15	38					02
	58	14			29				03
26	57				13	04			
37			46	12				05	

34:  
52  
58

			79	68	35	24			
		69	78					34	25
59				06				18	47
48				07	19				56
	27	08					39		16
	36		09			28			17
	49		15	38					02
	58	14			29				03
26		57			13	04			
37			46	12					05

35:  
52  
52

			79	68			35	24	
			69	78			25	34	
	59				06		18		47
	48				07		19		56
	27	08				39		16	
	36		09				28		17
49			15	38					02
58		14			29				03
26		57			13	04			
37			46	12					05

36:  
52  
58

				79	68	35	24			
			69	78					34	25
	59				06			18		47
	48				07		19			56
	27	08						39		16
	36		09				28			17
49			15	38						02
58		14			29					03
26		57			13	04				
37			46	12						05

37:  
55  
58

			79	68			35	24	
			69	78			25	34	
59				06				18	47
48				07	19				56
	37	08					29	16	
	26		09			38			17
	58	14			39				02
	49		15	28					03
	36	57			12	04			
27			46	13					05

38:  
55  
55

			79	68	35	24			
			69	78				34	25
	59				06		18		47
	48				07		19		56
	37	08				29			16
	26		09				38	17	
	58		14			39			02
	49		15	28					03
		36	57			12	04		
			27		46	13			05

39:  
55  
58

				79	68			35	24
			69	78			25	34	
	59				06			18	47
	48				07		19		56
	37	08						29	16
	26		09			38			17
	58		14			39			02
	49		15	28					03
		36	57			12	04		
			27		46	13			05

40:  
58  
58

		79	68	35	24		
	69	78				34	25
59			06			18	47
48				07	19		56
26	08					39	17
37		09			28		16
	49	15	38				02
	58	14		29			03
	36	57		12	04		
	27	46		13		05	

41:  
58  
58

		79	68				35	24
			78	69	25	34		
59				06			18	47
48					07		19	56
26		08				39		17
37			09				28	16
	49	15			38			02
	58	14	29					03
	36	57		12	04			
	27	46		13			05	

42:  
58  
58

			79	68	35	24		
	69	78					34	25
	59			06			18	47
	48				07	19		56
26		08					39	17
37			09			28		16
49			15	38				02
58		14			29			03
	36	57		12	04			
	27	46		13		05		

43:  
58  
58

		79	68					24	35
			78	69	34	25			
47					18	59		06	
56				19			48		07
39			17			08			26
28	16						09	37	
	38	49	02					15	
	29	58			03				14
	57	04		36		12			
	46		05		27		13		

44:  
188  
208

			68	79			35	24		
		49	78	36					25	
57					18	69	04			
							19	58	46	07
39		17	06				28			
	38							09	27	16
48			59		12				03	
	29				08				15	34
	56		14	02	37					
26	47	05						13		

45:  
217  
304

			68	79				24	35			
		49			78	36				25		
	57					69	18			04		
								58	09	16	47	
									19	38	27	06
26	39	17	08									
59	28			14	03							
48		05				29						13
37	46							02	15			
				56	12	07	34					

46:  
268  
746

		79	68					35	24	
		48	59	26	37					
				78	69	04	15			
					19	08			46	57
							39	28	17	06
27	36						18	09		
49	58								02	13
38	29	05	14							
56	47			03	12					
		16	07				25	34		

47:  
269  
746

		79	68					35	24	
		48	59	26	37					
				78	69	04	15			
					19	08			46	57
							39	28	17	06
27	36						18	09		
49	58								02	13
38	29	05	14							
	47	16		03	25					
56			07		12			34		

48:  
282  
746

		79	68					24	35		
				26	37	48	59				
78	69						15	04			
					19	08			56	47	
								39	28	17	06
36	27	18	09								
49	58									03	12
		05	14	38	29						
		46	57					02	13		
25	34				07	16					

49:  
282  
705

			68		79	35			24
				59		26	48		37
69					78			15	04
47						08	19		56
	39	06						28	17
27	18							09	36
	58	49		03					12
38			14	29					05
	46	57			13	02			
25			07	16					34

50:  
283  
746

		79	68					24	35	
				26	37	48	59			
78	69						15	04		
					19	08			56	47
							39	28	17	06
36	27	18	09							
49	58								03	12
		05	14	38	29					
	34		57		16	02				
25		46		07				13		

51:  
283  
705

			68		79	35			24
				59		26	48		37
69					78			15	04
47						08	19		56
	39	06						28	17
27	18							09	36
	58	49		03					12
38			14	29					05
		57			16		02	34	
25	46			07		13			

52:  
284  
746

		79	68					24	35	
				26	37	48	59			
78	69						15	04		
					19	08			56	47
							39	28	17	06
36	27	18	09							
	58	14		29					03	
49		05	38							12
	34		57		16	02				
25		46		07				13		

53:  
285  
746

		79	68					24	35	
				26	37	48	59			
78	69						15	04		
					19	08			56	47
	27	18				39			06	
36			09				28	17		
49	58								03	12
		05	14	38	29					
	34		57		16	02				
25		46		07				13		

54:  
286  
746

		79	68					24	35	
				26	37	48	59			
78	69						15	04		
					19	08			56	47
	27	18				39			06	
36			09				28	17		
49	58	14		29					03	
		05	38							12
34		57		16	02					
25		46		07				13		

55:  
287  
746

		79	68					35	24
				37	26	48	59		
78	69					15	04		
				19	08			47	56
36	18					29			07
	27	09				38	16		
	58	14		39				02	
49	05		28						13
25	46			17	03				
	34		57	06					12

56:  
312  
312

		79	68					35	24
				37	26	59	48		
69				18		04			57
78					19		05	46	
	27	08					39		16
	36		09			28		17	
	49		15		38			02	
	58	14		29					03
25			47	06		13			
34		56			07		12		

57:  
312  
690

		79	68					35	24
				37	26	59	48		
	69			18		04			57
78					19		05	46	
	27	08					39		16
36			09			28		17	
49			15		38			02	
	58	14		29					03
25			47	06		13			
	34	56			07		12		

58:  
319  
319

		68	79					35	24
				26	37	48	59		
69				18			04		57
78					09	15		46	
	27	19					38		06
	36		08			29		17	
	58	14	39					02	
	49	05			28				13
25		47			16	03			
	34		56	07					12

59:  
319  
746

		68	79					35	24
				26	37	48	59		
	69			18			04		57
78					09	15		46	
	27	19					38		06
36			08			29		17	
	58		14	39				02	
49		05			28				13
25		47			16	03			
	34		56	07					12

60:  
342  
342

		79	68					35	24
				37	26	58	49		
69				18		04			57
78					19		05	46	
	27	08					39		16
36			09				28	17	
	59	14			38			02	
	48		15	29					03
25			47	06			13		
	34	56			07	12			

61:  
342  
342

			79	68	35	24			
		49	58					37	26
69						04	18		57
78						19	05	46	
	27	08	16				39		
	36	17	09			28			
	59			38				02	14
	48				29			15	03
25			47	06	13				
	34	56			12	07			

62:  
343  
347

		79	68					35	24
				37	26	58	49		
69				18	04				57
78					19		05	46	
	36	08				29		17	
	27		09				38		16
	48		15		39			02	
	59	14		28					03
25			47	06		13			
	34	56			07		12		

63:  
690  
690

			79	36			58		24
		68			37	49		25	
	69			18			04		57
78					09	15		46	
	27	19					38		06
26			08				39	17	
59			14		28				03
	48	05		29					13
	35	47			16	02			
	34		56	07			12		

64:  
746  
746

		79	36			58		24	
		68			27	49		35	
69				18			04		57
	78				09	15		46	
37	19					28			06
	26		08				39	17	
	59		14		38			02	
48	05		29						13
25		47			16	03			
	34		56	07					12

The 28 sets of three orthogonal holey factorizations of type  $2^5$  are listed below in the following way. First, the index of the triple is given as  $\#i$ , for  $1 \leq i \leq 28$ . Beneath the index of the triple is the parenthesized index of the Room frame that yields the first two factorizations of the triple. The third holey factorization is fully listed with the holes bracketed. Beneath the index of the Room frame are the indices of the three factorizations; as with the Room frames, only the first factorization is necessarily in canonical form. Thus, for example, triple number 6 consists of Room frame 8 (which in turn consists of canonical factorization 1 together with a factorization isomorphic to canonical factorization 746) and the fully listed factorization which is isomorphic to canonical factorization 746.

	[01] 28 36 49 57		[01] 28 36 49 57		[01] 28 36 49 57	
	[01] 29 37 46 58		[01] 29 37 46 58		[01] 29 37 46 58	
#1:	[23] 05 19 47 68	#2:	[23] 05 19 47 68	#3:	[23] 05 18 47 69	#4:
(1)	[23] 08 14 56 79	(2)	[23] 08 14 56 79	(3)	[23] 09 14 56 78	(4)
1	[45] 02 17 38 69	1	[45] 02 16 39 78	1	[45] 02 17 39 68	1
690	[45] 06 12 39 78	690	[45] 07 12 38 69	690	[45] 06 12 38 79	690
690	[67] 03 18 24 59	690	[67] 03 18 24 59	690	[67] 03 19 25 48	690
	[67] 09 13 25 48		[67] 09 13 25 48		[67] 08 13 24 59	
	[89] 04 16 27 35		[89] 04 17 26 35		[89] 04 16 27 35	
	[89] 07 15 26 34		[89] 06 15 27 34		[89] 07 15 26 34	
	[01] 28 36 49 57					
	[01] 29 37 46 58					
	[23] 04 19 56 78					
	[23] 08 15 47 69					
	[45] 02 17 39 68					
	[45] 06 12 38 79					
	[67] 03 18 24 59					
	[67] 09 13 25 48					
	[89] 05 16 27 34					
	[89] 07 14 26 35					
	[01] 28 36 49 57		[01] 27 39 46 58		[01] 27 39 46 58	
	[01] 29 37 46 58		[01] 28 36 49 57		[01] 28 36 49 57	
#5:	[23] 04 18 56 79	#6:	[23] 05 19 47 68	#7:	[23] 05 19 47 68	#8:
(5)	[23] 09 15 47 68	(8)	[23] 08 14 56 79	(9)	[23] 08 14 56 79	(10)
1	[45] 02 17 38 69	1	[45] 03 16 29 78	1	[45] 02 17 38 69	1
690	[45] 06 12 39 78	746	[45] 07 12 38 69	746	[45] 06 13 29 78	690
690	[67] 03 19 25 48	746	[67] 02 18 34 59	746	[67] 03 18 24 59	690
	[67] 08 13 24 59		[67] 09 13 25 48		[67] 09 12 35 48	690
	[89] 05 16 27 34		[89] 04 17 26 35		[89] 04 16 25 37	
	[89] 07 14 26 35		[89] 06 15 24 37		[89] 07 15 26 34	

[01] 27 39 48 56  
 [01] 29 36 47 58  
 [23] 04 19 57 68  
 [23] 09 15 46 78  
 [45] 03 16 28 79  
 [45] 07 12 38 69  
 [67] 02 18 35 49  
 [67] 08 13 24 59  
 [89] 05 17 26 34  
 [89] 06 14 25 37

#9:  
 (11)  
 1  
 746  
 746

[01] 27 39 48 56  
 [01] 28 36 47 59  
 [23] 05 18 46 79  
 [23] 09 14 57 68  
 [45] 03 16 29 78  
 [45] 07 12 38 69  
 [67] 02 19 34 58  
 [67] 08 13 25 49  
 [89] 04 17 26 35  
 [89] 06 15 24 37

#10:  
 (12)  
 1  
 746  
 746

[01] 27 39 48 56  
 [01] 28 36 47 59  
 [23] 04 18 57 69  
 [23] 09 15 46 78  
 [45] 03 17 29 68  
 [45] 06 12 38 79  
 [67] 02 19 34 58  
 [67] 08 13 25 49  
 [89] 05 16 24 37  
 [89] 07 14 26 35

#11:  
 (13)  
 2  
 690  
 690

[01] 28 36 49 57  
 [01] 29 37 46 58  
 [23] 05 19 47 68  
 [23] 08 14 56 79  
 [45] 02 17 38 69  
 [45] 06 12 39 78  
 [67] 03 18 24 59  
 [67] 09 13 25 48  
 [89] 04 16 27 35  
 [89] 07 15 26 34

#12:  
 (14)  
 2  
 690  
 690

[01] 28 36 49 57  
 [01] 29 37 46 58  
 [23] 05 18 47 69  
 [23] 09 14 56 78  
 [45] 02 17 39 68  
 [45] 06 12 38 79  
 [67] 03 19 25 48  
 [67] 08 13 24 59  
 [89] 04 16 27 35  
 [89] 07 15 26 34

#13:  
 (15)  
 2  
 690  
 690

[01] 28 36 49 57  
 [01] 29 37 46 58  
 [23] 05 18 47 69  
 [23] 09 14 56 78  
 [45] 02 16 38 79  
 [45] 07 12 39 68  
 [67] 03 19 25 48  
 [67] 08 13 24 59  
 [89] 04 17 26 35  
 [89] 06 15 27 34

#14:  
 (16)  
 2  
 690  
 690

[01] 28 36 49 57  
 [01] 29 37 46 58  
 [23] 04 19 56 78  
 [23] 08 15 47 69  
 [45] 02 17 39 68  
 [45] 06 12 38 79  
 [67] 03 18 24 59  
 [67] 09 13 25 48  
 [89] 05 16 27 34  
 [89] 07 14 26 35

#15:  
 (18)  
 2  
 690  
 690

[01] 28 36 49 57  
 [01] 29 37 46 58  
 [23] 04 18 56 79  
 [23] 09 15 47 68  
 [45] 02 16 39 78  
 [45] 07 12 38 69  
 [67] 03 19 25 48  
 [67] 08 13 24 59  
 [89] 05 17 26 34  
 [89] 06 14 27 35

#16:  
 (20)  
 2  
 690  
 690

[01] 27 39 46 58  
[01] 29 36 48 57  
[23] 04 19 56 78  
[23] 09 15 47 68  
[45] 03 17 28 69  
[45] 06 12 38 79  
[67] 02 18 34 59  
[67] 08 13 25 49  
[89] 05 16 24 37  
[89] 07 14 26 35

#17:  
(21)  
2  
746  
746  
[01] 27 39 46 58  
[01] 28 36 49 57  
[23] 05 19 47 68  
[23] 08 14 56 79  
[45] 03 16 29 78  
[45] 07 12 38 69  
[67] 02 18 34 59  
[67] 09 13 25 48  
[89] 04 17 26 35  
[89] 06 15 24 37

#18:  
(22)  
2  
746  
746  
[01] 27 39 46 58  
[01] 28 36 49 57  
[23] 05 19 47 68  
[23] 08 14 56 79  
[45] 02 17 38 69  
[45] 06 13 29 78  
[67] 03 18 24 59  
[67] 09 12 35 48  
[89] 04 16 25 37  
[89] 07 15 26 34

#19:  
(23)  
2  
746  
746  
[01] 27 39 46 58  
[01] 28 36 49 57  
[23] 05 18 47 69  
[23] 09 14 56 78  
[45] 03 17 29 68  
[45] 06 12 38 79  
[67] 02 19 35 48  
[67] 08 13 24 59  
[89] 04 16 25 37  
[89] 07 15 26 34

#20:  
(24)  
2  
746  
746

[01] 27 39 46 58  
[01] 28 36 49 57  
[23] 04 18 56 79  
[23] 09 15 47 68  
[45] 03 16 29 78  
[45] 07 12 38 69  
[67] 02 19 35 48  
[67] 08 13 24 59  
[89] 05 17 26 34  
[89] 06 14 25 37

#21:  
(33)  
52  
55  
58  
[01] 28 39 46 57  
[01] 29 38 47 56  
[23] 04 16 58 79  
[23] 05 17 49 68  
[45] 02 18 37 69  
[45] 03 19 26 78  
[67] 08 13 24 59  
[67] 09 12 35 48  
[89] 06 15 27 34  
[89] 07 14 25 36

#22:  
(33)  
52  
55  
58  
[01] 28 39 47 56  
[01] 29 38 46 57  
[23] 04 16 58 79  
[23] 05 17 49 68  
[45] 02 18 37 69  
[45] 03 19 26 78  
[67] 08 13 24 59  
[67] 09 12 35 48  
[89] 06 15 27 34  
[89] 07 14 25 36

#23:  
(34)  
52  
58  
52  
[01] 28 39 47 56  
[01] 29 38 46 57  
[23] 04 16 58 79  
[23] 05 17 49 68  
[45] 02 18 37 69  
[45] 03 19 26 78  
[67] 08 12 34 59  
[67] 09 13 25 48  
[89] 06 14 27 35  
[89] 07 15 24 36

#24:  
(37)  
55  
58  
55

[01] 28 39 47 56  
[01] 29 38 46 57  
[23] 04 16 58 79  
[23] 05 17 49 68  
[45] 02 19 36 78  
[45] 03 18 27 69  
[67] 08 13 24 59  
[67] 09 12 35 48  
[89] 06 14 25 37  
[89] 07 15 26 34

#25:  
(40)  
58  
58  
58  
[01] 28 39 46 57  
[01] 29 38 47 56  
[23] 04 16 58 79  
[23] 05 17 49 68  
[45] 02 19 36 78  
[45] 03 18 27 69  
[67] 08 12 34 59  
[67] 09 13 25 48  
[89] 06 15 24 37  
[89] 07 14 26 35

#26:  
(40)  
58  
58  
58  
[01] 28 39 47 56  
[01] 29 38 46 57  
[23] 04 16 58 79  
[23] 05 17 49 68  
[45] 02 19 36 78  
[45] 03 18 27 69  
[67] 08 12 34 59  
[67] 09 13 25 48  
[89] 06 15 24 37  
[89] 07 14 26 35

#27:  
(41)  
58  
58  
58  
[01] 28 39 46 57  
[01] 29 38 47 56  
[23] 04 17 58 69  
[23] 05 16 49 78  
[45] 02 18 36 79  
[45] 03 19 27 68  
[67] 08 13 24 59  
[67] 09 12 35 48  
[89] 06 14 25 37  
[89] 07 15 26 34

#28:  
(41)  
58  
58  
58

[01] 28 39 47 56  
[01] 29 38 46 57  
[23] 04 17 58 69  
[23] 05 16 49 78  
[45] 02 18 36 79  
[45] 03 19 27 68  
[67] 08 13 24 59  
[67] 09 12 35 48  
[89] 06 14 25 37  
[89] 07 15 26 34